

APPENDIX 4

Open Letter to President Clinton

26 June 1997

We, the undersigned, believe that the current US-led effort to expand NATO, the focus of the recent Helsinki and Paris Summits, is a policy error of historic proportions. We believe that NATO expansion will decrease allied security and unsettle European stability for the following reasons:

In Russia, NATO expansion, which continues to be opposed across the entire political spectrum, will strengthen the non-democratic opposition, undercut those who favor reform and cooperation with the West, bring the Russians to question the entire post-Cold War settlement, and galvanize resistance in the Duma to the START II and III treaties;

In Europe, NATO expansion will draw a new line of division between the 'ins' and the 'outs', foster instability, and ultimately diminish the sense of security of those countries which are not included;

In NATO, expansion, which the Alliance has indicated is open-ended, will inevitably degrade NATO's ability to carry out its primary mission and will involve US security guarantees to countries with serious border and national minority problems, and unevenly developed systems of democratic government;

In the US, NATO expansion will trigger an extended debate over its indeterminate, but certainly high, cost and will call into question the US commitment to the Alliance, traditionally and rightly regarded as a centerpiece of US foreign policy.

Because of these serious objections, and in the absence of any reason for a rapid decision, we strongly urge that the NATO expansion process be suspended while alternative actions are pursued. These include:

Opening the economic and political doors of the European Union to Central and Eastern Europe; developing an enhanced

Partnership for Peace program; supporting a cooperative NATO–Russian relationship; and continuing the arms reduction and transparency process, particularly with respect to nuclear weapons and materials, the major threat to US security, and with respect to conventional military forces in Europe.

Russia does not now pose a threat to its western neighbors and the nations of Central and Eastern Europe are not in danger. For this reason, and the others cited above, we believe that NATO expansion is neither necessary nor desirable and that this ill-conceived policy can and should be put on hold.

List of Signatories

Ambassador George Bunn (IIS Consulting Professor, Center for International Security and Arms Control, Stanford University)

The Honorable Robert Bowie (Former Director, Policy Planning Staff, and Counselor, Department of State; former Deputy Director for Intelligence, CIA)

Senator Bill Bradley (US Senator (1979–96))

Professor David Calleo (Director of European Studies, Nitze School of Advanced International Studies, Johns Hopkins University)

Ambassador Richard T. Davies (Former Ambassador to Poland (1973–78); Political Officer, NATO International Staff; Deputy Assistant Secretary of State for European Affairs)

Ambassador Jonathan Dean (Former Ambassador heading US Delegation to NATO Warsaw Pact Negotiations on Mutual and Balanced Force Reductions; Deputy US Negotiator, Four Power Agreement on Berlin; Adviser for International Security Issues, Union of Concerned Scientists)

Professor Paul Doty (Emeritus Director, Center for Science and International Affairs, John F. Kennedy School of Government, Harvard University)

Susan Eisenhower (Chairman, Center for Political and Strategic Studies)

David M. Evans (Former Senior Adviser to Helsinki Commission (1990–95); President, Integrated Strategies International)

Ambassador David Fischer (President, World Affairs Council of Northern California)

Ambassador Raymond Garthoff (Former Ambassador to Bulgaria (1977–79); Senior Fellow, Brookings Institution)

- Dr Morton H. Halperin (Former National Security Council and Department of Defense Official)
- Owen Harries (Editor, *The National Interest*)
- Senator Gary Hart (US Senator (1975–87))
- Ambassador Arthur Hartman (Former Ambassador to the Soviet Union (1981–87))
- Senator Mark Hatfield (US Senator (1967–87))
- Professor John P. Holdren (Chairman, National Academy of Sciences Committee on International Security and Arms Control; Professor, Harvard University)
- The Honorable Townsend Hoopes (Former Under-secretary of the US Air Force)
- Senator Gordon Humphrey (US Senator (1979–91))
- The Honorable Fred Ikle (Former Under-secretary of Defense for Policy (1981–88))
- Senator Bennett Johnston (US Senator (1972–96))
- Professor Carl Kaysen (Professor of Political Economy, Harvard University)
- The Honorable Spurgeon Keeny (Former Deputy Director Arms Control and Disarmament Agency; Senior Staff Member, National Security Council; President, Arms Control Association)
- Ambassador James Leonard (Former Assistant Director, Arms Control and Disarmament Agency; former Deputy Permanent Representative to the United Nations)
- Dr Edward Luttwak (Senior Fellow, Center for Strategic and International Studies)
- Professor Michael Mandelbaum (Professor, Nitze School of Advanced International Studies, Johns Hopkins University)
- Ambassador Jack Matlock (Former Ambassador to the Soviet Union (1987–91))
- The Honorable C. William Maynes (Former Editor, *Foreign Policy*; Former Assistant Secretary of State for International Organizations Affairs (1977–80))
- Ambassador Richard McCormack (Former Under-secretary of State for Economic Affairs (1989–91))
- The Honorable David McGiffert (Assistant Secretary for International Security Affairs (1977–81))
- The Honorable Robert S. McNamara (Secretary of Defense (1961–68); President of the World Bank (1968–91))

- Jack Mendelsohn (Former Senior Foreign Service Officer; Deputy Director, Arms Control Association)
- Philip Merrill (Former NATO Assistant Secretary General)
- Ambassador Paul H. Nitze (Former Special Adviser to President Reagan and Secretary of State Shultz for Arms Control; former Deputy Secretary of Defense; former Secretary of the Navy)
- Senator Sam Nunn (US Senator (1972–96))
- Ambassador Herbert S. Okun (Ambassador to East Germany (1980–83); Ambassador to the United Nations (1985–89))
- Professor W.K.H. Panofsky (Emeritus Professor, Stanford University)
- Major General Christian Patte (ret.) (Former Director of NATO Logistics (1990–96))
- Professor Richard Pipes (Director, East European and Soviet Affairs for National Security Council)
- Lt. General Robert E. Pursley (ret.) (Lieutenant General, US Air Force)
- Professor George Rathjens (Professor, Massachusetts Institute of Technology)
- The Honorable Stanley Resor (Former Secretary of the Army; Ambassador to the Mutual Balanced Force Reduction Negotiation)
- The Honorable John B. Rhinelander (Former Legal Adviser to US SALT I Delegation; Deputy Legal Adviser, Department of State)
- Vice Admiral John J. Shanahan (ret.) (Former Military Advisor to the US Ambassador to NATO; Director, Center for Defense Information)
- The Honorable Marshall Shulman (Professor Emeritus, Columbia University)
- Dr. John Steinbruner (Senior Fellow and former Director, Foreign Policy Studies, Brookings Institution)
- Admiral Stansfield Turner (ret.) (Former Director of the CIA)
- Ambassador Richard Viets (Former Ambassador to Tanzania and Jordan)
- The Honorable Paul Warnke (Former Director, Arms Control and Disarmament Agency; Assistant Secretary of Defense for International Security Affairs)
- Admiral James D. Watkins (ret.) (Former Secretary of Energy; former Chief of Naval Operations)